

Message

---

**From:** LEVINE, STEVEN L [AG/1000] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=NA-1000-01/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=██████████]  
**Sent:** 1/14/2011 5:23:29 PM  
**To:** SALTMIRAS, DAVID A [AG/1000] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=NA-1000-01/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=██████████]; FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=NA-1000-01/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=██████████]; ██████████ [AG/5040] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=EA-5041-01/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=██████████]; ██████████ [AG/5040] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=EA-5041-01/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=██████████]; GOLDSTEIN, DANIEL A [AG/1000] [/O=MONSANTO/OU=NA-1000-01/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=██████████]  
**Subject:** RE: Article: Glyphosate & Cell Death (another from Seralini)

Additionally, Syngenta reviewed and commented along with us and a very comprehensive review was eventually submitted. I think our comments were eventually longer than the paper. David is correct Bill has the combined comments from all of us.

Steve

**From:** SALTMIRAS, DAVID A [AG/1000]  
**Sent:** Friday, January 14, 2011 10:47 AM  
**To:** FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]; ██████████ [AG/5040]; ██████████ [AG/5040]; GOLDSTEIN, DANIEL A [AG/1000]  
**Cc:** LEVINE, STEVEN L [AG/1000]  
**Subject:** RE: Article: Glyphosate & Cell Death (another from Seralini)

Attached are the comments I have on the original manuscript to Regulatory Toxicology & Pharmacology. I do not believe Donna's and Steve Levine's comments are captured here. I think Bill Heydens was the intended reviewer for journal & we provided him with our comments. My recollection was that we had extensive comments on the first round, then for the second round, some rather inappropriate Seralini responses were included..... I recall the plea "Please Mr Editor, not an agrochemical company reviewer", or something to that effect.

*David Saltmiras, Ph.D., D.A.B.T.*  
Toxicology Manager  
Regulatory Product Safety Center  
Monsanto  
ph ██████████

**From:** FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]  
**Sent:** Friday, January 14, 2011 8:04 AM

**To:** [REDACTED] [AG/5040]; [REDACTED] [AG/5040]; GOLDSTEIN, DANIEL A [AG/1000];  
SALTMIRAS, DAVID A [AG/1000]

**Subject:** RE: Article: Glyphosate & Cell Death (another from Seralini)

Dan,

I am in a meeting but we did an extensive peer review on this publication for another journal, we rejected it as did the journal. I will find those comments and send them to you.

Donna

**From:** [REDACTED] [AG/5040]

**Sent:** Friday, January 14, 2011 1:29 AM

**To:** [REDACTED] [AG/5040]; GOLDSTEIN, DANIEL A [AG/1000]; SALTMIRAS, DAVID A [AG/1000];  
FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]

**Subject:** RE: Article: Glyphosate & Cell Death (another from Seralini)

Dan,

These are the same formulations which they tested in their earlier paper.

They also happen to be the same set of formulations that CRIIGEN (Prof Seralini's anti-GM organization) and another anti pesticide group, MDRGF, have accused the French regulators of not evaluating properly, and accused us of registering products without declaring that they contain tallow amine. We have just worked on a brief to counter this.

Regards

[REDACTED]

**From:** [REDACTED] [AG/5040]

**Sent:** 14 January 2011 08:03

**To:** GOLDSTEIN, DANIEL A [AG/1000]; [REDACTED] [AG/5040]; SALTMIRAS, DAVID A [AG/1000]; FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]

**Subject:** RE: Article: Glyphosate & Cell Death (another from Seralini)

Dan,

Yes, these products are Roundup formulations, all these products are or were sold in L&G segment:

Roundup Express = MON 77737

Roundup Bioforce = MON 52276

Roundup GT 400 = MON 35012 (not on the market anymore, lost registration)

Roundup GT Plus = MON 78294

Regards, [REDACTED]

**From:** GOLDSTEIN, DANIEL A [AG/1000]

**Sent:** Friday, January 14, 2011 12:14 AM

**To:** [REDACTED] [AG/5040]; SALTMIRAS, DAVID A [AG/1000]; [REDACTED] [AG/5040]; FARMER, DONNA R [AG/1000]

**Subject:** RE: Article: Glyphosate & Cell Death (another from Seralini)

All-

When they re-cored my computer, it seems I lost Lotus Notes... no longer supported.

Anyway- I can't get to the product MSDS data at the moment and can't locate these products in our formulations (but they may just have MON #), and the EU database site (Lotus Notes based) is crashing on me when I log on.

**ARE THESE ACTUALLY OUR PRODUCTS as stated in the paper???? : If so- what are the MON numbers???** (Sorry... kind of stuck here!!)

**Dan**

**Four main R formulations which have been used in agriculture (Monsanto, Anvers, Belgium) have been chosen in this study:**

**Express® 7.2 g/l of G called glyphosate or N-(phosphonomethyl) glycine, product number 2010321**

**Bioforce® 360 g/l of G, product number 9800036**

**GT® 400 g/l of G, product number 8800425**

**GT+® 450 g/l of G, product number 2020448.**